

# THE OXFORD HANDBOOK OF

# ANIMAL ETHICS

Edited by

TOM L. BEAUCHAMP

and

R. G. FREY









# **CONTENTS**

Preface, ix Contributors, xi

Introduction, 3

Tom L. Beauchamp

### PART I. HISTORY OF PHILOSOPHY

- 1. Animals in Classical and Late Antique Philosophy, 35 *Stephen R. L. Clark*
- 2. Animals and Ethics in the History of Modern Philosophy, 61 *Aaron Garrett*

## PART II. TYPES OF ETHICAL THEORY

- 3. Interacting with Animals: A Kantian Approach, 91 *Christine Korsgaard*
- 4. Virtue Ethics and the Treatment of Animals, 119 *Rosalind Hursthouse*
- 5. A Humean Account of the Status and Character of Animals, 144 *Julia Driver*
- 6. Utilitarianism and Animals, 172 *R. G. Frey*
- 7. Rights Theory and Animal Rights, 198

  Tom L. Beauchamp





vi Contents

8. The Capabilities Approach and Animal Entitlements, 228

Martha Nussbaum

## PART III. MORAL STATUS AND PERSON THEORY

- 9. The Idea of Moral Standing, 255 *Christopher W. Morris*
- Animals, Fundamental Moral Standing, and Speciesism, 276
   David Copp
- 11. Human Animals and Nonhuman Persons, 304
  Sarah Chan and John Harris
- 12. Are Nonhuman Animals Persons?, 332 *Michael Tooley*

#### PART IV. ANIMAL MINDS AND THEIR MORAL SIGNIFICANCE

- 13. Animal Mentality: Its Character, Extent, and Moral Significance, 373

  Peter Carruthers
- 14. Mindreading and Moral Significance in Nonhuman Animals, 407 *José Luis Bermúdez*
- 15. Minimal Minds, 441 *Bryce Huebner*
- 16. Beyond Anthropomorphism: Attributing Psychological Properties to Animals, 469 Kristin Andrews
- 17. Animal Pain and Welfare: Can Pain Sometimes Be Worse for Them Than for Us?, 495

  Sahar Akhtar
- 18. Animals That Act for Moral Reasons, 519

  Mark Rowlands







CONTENTS vii

19. The Moral Life of Animals, 547

Michael Bradie

## PART V. SPECIES AND THE ENGINEERING OF SPECIES

- 20. On the Origin of Species Notions and Their Ethical Limitations, 577

  Mark Greene
- 21. On the Nature of Species and the Moral Significance of their Extinction, 603 *Russell Powell*
- 22. Are All Species Equal?, 628

  David Schmidtz
- 23. Genetically Modified Animals: Should There Be Limits to Engineering the Animal Kingdom?, 641 *Julian Savulescu*
- 24. Human/Nonhuman Chimeras: Assessing the Issues, 671 *Henry T. Greely*

## PART VI. PRACTICAL ETHICS

- 25. The Moral Relevance of the Distinction between Domesticated and Wild Animals, 701

  Clare Palmer
- 26. The Moral Significance of Animal Pain and Animal Death, 726 *Elizabeth Harman*
- 27. The Ethics of Confining Animals: From Farms to Zoos to Human Homes, 738 David DeGrazia
- 28. Keeping Pets, 769

  Hilary Bok
- 29. Animal Experimentation in Biomedical Research, 796

  Hugh LaFollette





# OUP • UNCORRECTED PROOF

viii Contents

30. Ethical Issues in the Application of Biotechnology to Animals in Agriculture, 826 Robert Streiffer and John Basl

- 31. Environmental Ethics, Hunting, and the Place of Animals, 855 *Gary Varner*
- 32. Vegetarianism, 877 *Stuart Rachels*
- 33. The Use of Animals in Toxicological Research, 906 *Andrew Rowan*
- 34. What's Ethics Got to Do with It? The Roles of Government Regulation in Research Animal Protection, 919

  Jeffrey Kahn
- 35. Literary Works and Animal Ethics, 932 Tzachi Zamir

Index, 957







# Preface

When Oxford University Press issued an invitation to us to prepare a volume on animal minds and the ethics of human uses of animals for its series of Handbooks of Philosophy, we enthusiastically accepted. This multifaceted and rapidly growing area of scholarly activity deserves sustained and careful work from philosophers and professionals in several disciplines. We have been fortunate as editors to successfully plead this case with the outstanding group of contributors to this volume. All chapters are original essays in either already prominent or largely unexplored areas of animal ethics.

The Handbook is aimed at an audience that seeks accessible and high-level philosophical work. We have asked contributors not to scale down their contributions to make them more accessible to a wide audience, but one exception is made: The Introduction to this volume is intended for a multidisciplinary audience, including readers who may for the first time be encountering complex philosophical arguments. The Introduction presents the organizational structure of the volume and each author's main arguments and conclusions.

The preparation of this volume has taken several years. We deeply appreciate the willingness of several of our authors who have encountered personal difficulties during this period to plough ahead and complete the work. We are likewise grateful for their willingness to go through numerous drafts and to exhibit great patience as this book was brought to completion.

We gratefully acknowledge the help of Yashar Saghai in the final stages of the delivery of this manuscript to the publisher. Without his help, the book might have been delayed for several weeks. We also thank Peter Ohlin for his efficient arrangement of impartial reviews during the early stages of our planning and of course to the anonymous reviewers themselves.

Washington, D.C. TLB Bowling Green, Ohio RGF







# Contributors

Sahar Akhtar, Department of Philosophy, University of Virginia-Charlottesville

Kristin Andrews, Department of Philosophy, York University, Toronto, Canada

John Basl, Department of Philosophy, University of Wisconsin-Madison

**Tom L. Beauchamp,** Department of Philosophy and Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University

**José Luis Bermúdez,** Dean of the College of Liberal Arts, and Department of Philosophy, Texas A&M University

**Hilary Bok,** Department of Philosophy and Berman Institute of Bioethics, The Johns Hopkins University

Michael Bradie, Department of Philosophy, Bowling Green State University, Ohio

**Peter Carruthers,** Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland, College Park

**Sarah Chan,** Centre for Social Ethics and Policy, The University of Manchester, UK

Stephen R. L. Clark, Department of Philosophy, University of Liverpool, UK

**David Copp,** Department of Philosophy, University of California-Davis

**David Degrazia,** Department of Philosophy, The George Washington University, Washington

Julia Driver, Department of Philosophy, Washington University in St. Louis

**R. G. Frey,** Department of Philosophy and The Social Philosophy and Policy Center, Bowling Green State University, Ohio

Aaron Garrett, Department of Philosophy, Boston University





•

xii contributors

Henry T. Greely, Center for Law and the Biosciences, Stanford University Law School

Mark Greene, Department of Philosophy, University of Delaware

**Elizabeth Harman,** Department of Philosophy and The University Center for Human Values, Princeton University

**John Harris,** Centre for Social Ethics and Policy and The Institute for Science, Ethics and Innovation (at the School of Law), The University of Manchester, UK

Bryce Huebner, Department of Philosophy, Georgetown University

**Rosalind Hursthouse,** Department of Philosophy, The University of Auckland, New Zealand

Jeffrey Kahn, Center for Bioethics and Department of Medicine, University of Minnesota

Christine M. Korsgaard, Department of Philosophy, Harvard University

Hugh Lafollette, Cole Chair in Ethics, University of South Florida, St. Petersburg

**Christopher W. Morris,** Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland-College Park

**Martha Nussbaum,** Law School, Divinity School, and Department of Philosophy, University of Chicago

Clare Palmer, Department of Philosophy, Texas A&M University

Russell Powell, Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, Oxford University, UK

Stuart Rachels, Department of Philosophy, University of Alabama-Tuscaloosa

**Andrew Rowan,** The Humane Society of the United States, Washington, D.C.

Mark Rowlands, Department of Philosophy, University of Miami-Coral Gables

Julian Savulescu, Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, Oxford University, UK

David Schmidtz, Department of Philosophy, University of Arizona







CONTRIBUTORS Xiii

Robert Streiffer, Department of Philosophy, University of Wisconsin-Madison

Michael Tooley, Department of Philosophy, University of Colorado-Boulder

Gary Varner, Department of Philosophy, Texas A&M University

Tzachi Zamir, English Department, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel



